JOSEPH SMITH’S HISTORY CONFIRMED

by Craig N. Ray

It is no secret that Rev. Wesley P. Walters was critical of claims made by Joseph Smith, Jr., and his followers. Rev. Walters was active in critical circles, and in 1990 published a booklet that put forth supposed proof that the First Vision, as related by Joseph Smith, was a fabrication that could not have been true. In *Joseph Smith’s Move to Palmyra and Manchester, NY (A Preliminary Report)*, Walters based his assertions on discrepancies he noted in Joseph Smith’s story and certain historical records.

The purpose of this paper is to review the claims made by Rev. Walters in the light of a wide range of historical records. Once this is fully and fairly done, it becomes evident that Joseph’s telling of the First Vision is consistent with history, and that Rev. Walter’s criticisms and conclusions easily fall by the wayside.

JOSEPH’S STORY AND THE CRITICS

In 1838, when Joseph Smith, Jr. began his narrative of the rise of the Mormon Church, he was able to relate historical facts that would validate his now-famous First Vision story. Religious excitement was mentioned as the motivation for young Smith to seek God in prayer, resulting in his vision. In the process of writing his history, Smith included his family’s move from Vermont to Palmyra, New York. In the 1838 history, Joseph states that his father’s move to Palmyra took place when young Joseph, born in December 1805, was in his “tenth year, or thereabouts.” This would place Joseph at approximately nine years old, which corresponds to sometime in the year 1815 or early in 1816. The rest of the family did not move until sometime after March of 1816.

Joseph next remarks that, “in about four years after my father’s arrival at Palmyra, he moved with his family into Manchester,” which was the next township south of Palmyra. This would date the family’s move to Manchester sometime in 1818 or early 1819. They were seen in their log house in the winter of 1819–1820, in Manchester.

Joseph continues with “some time in the second year after our removal to Manchester, there was in the place where we lived, an unusual excitement on the subject of religion.” This excitement led to Joseph’s prayer in the woods, at which time he says that he was answered by two personages appearing to him, God the Father and the Son. This would date the religious excitement and subsequent vision to 1820. That is why Joseph specifically dates his vision as “the spring of eighteen hundred and twenty.” Critics of the Church have tried to show that Smith may have made a mistake when he stated the timing of the move to Manchester. We shall investigate these claims.

DOCUMENTARY OVERVIEW

Documentary evidence came to light in 1970 to show that the Smiths were living in a log cabin within the Palmyra borders as late as April 1822. This discovery led Donald Enders, of the LDS Church’s Historical Department, to do an in-depth study of this matter and publish an article in the Church’s *Ensign* magazine that concluded “Although the farm was located on the Manchester side of the Palmyra-Manchester township line, the Smith’s inadvertently built their cabin on the Palmyra side” on property owned by someone else.

Newly discovered documents from Vermont and western New York further collaborate the Smith story. The tax rolls of Lebanon, New Hampshire, a “Warning Out” notice at Norwich, Vermont, and the weather situation there—as well as the road tax lists, real estate assessment records and other legal documents from the Palmyra and Manchester area—all testify to the validity of the Smith family move to Palmyra and Manchester, as stated in the official account.

THE SMITHS IN VERMONT

Most LDS writers, including historian Dr. Larry Porter of Brigham Young University, have accepted the 1816 date for the arrival of the en-
tire family in Palmyra. Accordingly they have placed the Smiths' stay in Norwich, Vermont (the town from which they made their departure for Palmyra) during the years 1814, 1815, and 1816. The reason for this three-year span is the history dictated by Joseph's mother, Lucy Mack Smith. In it she stated that after a stay just across the Connecticut River at Lebanon, New Hampshire, the family moved to "Norrige" (still pronounced that way by the natives), where they endured three seasons of crop failure in the years 1814–1816.

With careful investigation of the extant Vermont and New Hampshire documents, these dates can be verified. The Smiths were in Lebanon, New Hampshire in May 1814, as the township tax rolls verify. Of equal importance, the Norwich town records report that Joseph Smith and his family were "warned out of town" in March 1816. This record, the only one found for a "Joseph Smith and family" found in the town's "Warning Out" book, shows that the town's selectmen issued the warrant on March 15, and it was served on the family on March 27, 1816. A "warning out of town" should not be thought of as a prejudicial treatment of the Smiths, because almost every family settling in a Vermont town in those days received such a warning. These warnings reminded strangers "that it was time for them to 'depart this town.'" These "Warning Outs" consisted of two parts. The first part was the notification of the selectmen when strangers had been taken in. (This included information of arrival date and the previous town from which they could be sent back to.) The second part consisting of the warning out (meaning it was time to "depart said town hereof").

Rev. Wesley Walters found the second part of the notification, the warning out of town for 1816, for the Smith family. It is a paper on which the selectmen ordered the constable "to summon Joseph Smith and family now residing in Norwich to depart said town hereof." This was dated "15th day of March AD 1816." It was served on the Smith home on March 27, 1816.

Three successive crop failures, the idea of good land in New York, and the "Warning Out of town" were no doubt the factors that resulted in Joseph Smith, Sr.'s decision to leave Vermont and move to New York.

The fact that three crop failures in a row caused the Smiths to be in a poor and destitute situation was probably a key in the selectmen deciding it was time to require the Smiths to "depart their town." Lucy Mack Smith records in her history that they were renting from Esquire Murdock, who was elected the town's Grand Juror. Father Smith went with a Mr. Howard to New York, leaving his family to pack and get ready to vacate Norwich.

A weather pattern for 1816 helps substantiate that 1816 was the time of the final crop failure that forced the Smith family to abandon Vermont and move to New York. It was reported that February was "warmer than usual. Crops were planted. Warm balmy days..." were reported until March. It was reported, "we were melting under the heat of summer," but then the weather changed in March. It was reported that the people were visited by a piercing northeast wind, with a hail or drizzling sleet during the day. By the next day "the bloom of apricot and peach trees [were] covered with icicles."

This devastating cold storm and resultant crop failures no doubt were the determining factors to cause the Smiths to leave for better ground.

**The Smiths in Palmyra**

Joseph Smith's mother records that her husband left Vermont ahead of them and went to Palmyra and sent for them later when he was ready for them to come.

Road tax records that the LDS Genealogical Department copied indicates Joseph Smith, Sr. was in Palmyra Road District #26 from 1817 till 1822. Since the road tax records were done in April, this indicates that Father Smith did not arrive in Palmyra to stay until after April 1816 and yet before April 1817. The road district system was established by New York law. It required "oversseers" to compile a list of all those residing in their road district who were required by law to work on the roads. This list included all landowners ("free holders") who were 21 years of age or older, as well as all free males of the same age, residing within that district. Each person on the list was required to put in at least one day's work per year, clearing brush, stones, and fallen trees, repairing bridges, filling holes, and clearing paths through snow in wintertime. These lists were required by law to be turned in by April 18, 1816 to the three commissioners of highways who would assign the number of days each person was to work. These lists were then turned over to the town clerk the latter part of April to be recorded by him. The road tax lists show that Joseph Smith, Sr. first appears on the list for District #26 in April 1817. He obviously was not in Palmyra at the time to have his name recorded on the list for 1816. The names follow the order in which their residences and businesses occur. From this list, it is apparent that Joseph Smith, Sr. was living somewhere toward the west end of Main Street in 1817.

Joseph Sr.'s name appears in close proximity to Joseph D. Hayward, (apparently a newcomer to Palmyra as his name also does not appear on the lists prior to 1817) who ran a cooper shop, and as Joseph Sr., like his father, knew the barrel-making trade, he may have found...
employment with Hayward. Joseph Sr. possibly did not start his own business until after the arrival of his entire family. That would account for him not being listed along with the other businessmen in Palmyra. Smith’s name occurs on the tax records again in 1818 and 1819. Some critics have erroneously supposed the Smiths were still in Vermont in 1818. These tax records and an eye-witness account do not support that conclusion.29

In April 1820 the name of Alvin, Joseph Sr.s’ oldest son, appears for the first time. He shows up among the merchants in downtown Palmyra, while Joseph Sr., for the first time appears at the end of the list. Joseph Sr. is obviously living in the log house that the Smiths built. This log house is about 59 feet north of the Palmyra-Farmington (now Manchester) town line, just to the west of Stafford St.30 This log cabin was unquestionably located on a site excavated by Brigham Young University in 1982. This small cabin has now been re-built by the LDS Church in the same location as the original. In 1820 it stood in Palmyra township on property owned by Samuel Jennings, and served as a sort of benchmark for a survey crew that on June 13, 1820, laid out the extension of Stafford Road.31

Of interest is the fact that Alvin had turned 21 on February 11, 1819. If Alvin was living in Palmyra in April 1819 he would have been on the tax records and would have been required by law to help maintain the roads. Where was Alvin if the family moved in 1816 to Palmyra? If the family contracted to purchase the farm in 1818, this would explain Alvin’s disappearance. Lucy (Joseph’s mother) states,

> My husband and his sons, Alvin and Hyrum, set themselves to work to pay for one hundred acres of land, for which Mr. Smith contracted with a land agent. In a year, we made nearly all of the first payment, erected a log house and commenced clearing. I believe something like thirty acres of land were got ready for cultivation the first year... When the time for making the second payment drew nigh, Alvin went from home to get work, in order to raise the money, and after much hardship and fatigue, returned with the required amount.32

It is evident that Alvin left home prior to April 1819 to work and therefore his name was not put on the Road Tax Records.

Pomeroy Tucker, an eyewitness, wrote that the Smith family arrived in Palmyra “in the summer of 1816.” He further stated, “in 1818 they settled upon a nearly wild unimproved piece of land...about two miles south of Palmyra, being on the north border of the town of Manchester, Ontario County.”33 Thomas Cook, in his history of Palmyra, claims that the Smiths arrived in Palmyra “in the autumn of 1816.” He also stated that “in 1818, when they moved to this tract of wild land to occupy it...” which was in Manchester.34 Another account states, “Joseph Smith, Sr., came here (Palmyra) in 1816 from Royalton, Vt.;...in 1818 the family moved to a wild farm, two miles south of the village, and lived in a log house about twelve years.”35 Though the Smiths did move to Manchester in 1818 or early 1819, they did not live in the log house for 12 years, as stated above, as they built a larger frame house in 1822–1823 and moved into it. It was across the street and further south than the log house. (More about the frame house later in this document.) Joshua Stafford, Barton Stafford, and Henry Harris all remember the Smiths “in Manchester” in 1819 or 1820.36

The Smiths arrived in Palmyra in 1816, and according to Tucker, Cook and others, purchased land in Manchester in 1818, and Alvin made the second payment in 1819. All of this evidence corroborates the Joseph Smith history.

The Smiths in Manchester

Contracting for the Manchester farm, Lucy tells us that once she had arrived in Palmyra, the family began to make plans to acquire some property of their own. To this end, the family contracted for 100 acres of “Everson [Evertson] land.”37 Many contracts of the day show that the usual pattern for contracts resulted in three or more payments, each due a year apart, on the original date of the contract. Title to the property was retained by the seller, and property tax was sometimes paid by the buyer, according to the contract. Sometimes stipulations such as erecting a cabin within a year and clearing a certain number of acres were required. Joseph Sr. and Alvin entered into a contractual arrangement on behalf of the family sometime in 1818 and succeeded in building a log cabin and clearing thirty acres.38 This land deal caused the Smith’s name to appear on the census records in 1820 in Farmington (later named Manchester).

The U.S. Census Bureau listed the Smiths in Farmington (now Manchester) in 1820. The Smith farm, clearing the land and a log house, all supported evidence that the Smiths, and most everyone else, considered themselves in Manchester, even though they technically lived about 59 feet off their property. Legal U.S. documents now considered the Smiths in Farmington (later called Manchester) even though, technically, the log house was 59 feet away on the Palmyra side of the line.
The Smith farm in Farmington (now Manchester) embraced 100 acres, one third of the original 300 acres of the original Lot No. 1 in that township. The assessment roll for June 22, 1820, makes it clear that the entire 300 acres of Lot No. 1 was still in the name of the heirs of Nicholas Evertson. We don’t have the Smiths’ contract, but by June 1820, possibly only two payments had been made on the property. The heirs of Evertson, through the land agent, had not released the property name to Smith. By 1821, the land was assessed to Joseph Smith for the first time. This could all be written in the contract that has not surfaced at this time. Before making another payment, the land agent, Zechariah Seymour, died. Mother Smith adds that because the land agent had died, they were unable to make the final payment.39

William Smith says that they were to make $100 a year in payments, and the value being $700, a payment in 1818, 1819, 1820, and 1821 would put the Smith’s more than half paid, and then the tax lien was put into the Smith’s name before July of 1821. Before the next payment in 1822, the land agent died.

Moving to Manchester, it seems probable that the Smiths did not formally move to the new frame house on the east side of Stafford Road until after the winter of 1822. The log house that everyone says they built in 1818 or 1819 was inadvertently built on the wrong side of the Farmington (Manchester)-Palmyra line. Such an “accident” is entirely possible in a day when boundary lines may not have been well established. This would mean that the Smith family did not actually dwell on the Manchester side of the line until after November of 1822, when according to Mother Smith, “the frame was raised, and all the materials necessary for its [their frame house] speedy completion were procured.”41 “An unidentifiable newspaper article on microfilm at Brigham Young University library” mentions that after some time, it was discovered that the cabin originally built by the Smiths was not on the land originally contracted by them. Arrangements were then made with Samuel Jennings to purchase the land on which the log cabin was erected.42

Finding the Smiths not on their property by just under 60 feet, the Palmyra road tax overseers recorded the Smiths on their road tax lists until 1822 when the Smiths were able to raise the frame of a larger house (this time, on their property), move into the house, and work to complete the house after the move.43 This move occurred before the tax liens were completed in 1823. The tax liens on the property increased $300 to reflect the move.44 The move to the log house by the Smiths in 1818 was considered a move to Manchester by Joseph Jr., in his history, for it was a move to their farm where he was going to labor for many years to come. An imaginary line separated them from physically being in Manchester.

Joseph’s History also includes Lucy in his family when he says they moved to Manchester,45 even though she was not born till July 18, 1821, while the family technically lived about 59 feet north of Manchester. Other contemporaries also included little Lucy with the rest of the family when they mentioned the move to Manchester. Pomeroy Tucker included Lucy when he says the family moved from Vermont in 1816.46 The Hon. George W. Cowles, in his book, Landmarks of Wayne County, also included Lucy’s name with the other children when the family moved in 1816 to Palmyra.47 Joseph’s writings were consistent with the writers of his day.

The township south of Palmyra was named Farmington until March 31, 1821, when its name was changed to Burt. Another name change on April 16, 1822, resulted in the final name of Manchester.48 The contemporaries of Joseph Smith, all writing after 1822, called the move to the log house a move to Manchester.49 Joseph Jr. was no exception.

Joseph Sr.’s name remained on the road tax records of Palmyra until 1822, since his home was technically on the Palmyra side of the line. Alvin’s name does not appear in 1819 (remember that he was off earning money for the property payment according to his mother), but his name does show up in 1820, 1821 and 1822. Hyrum’s name shows up in 1821, but not in 1822. Hyrum could have hired out for work in a neighboring town for which we do not have the road lists. It is possible that he moved onto the Manchester farm where he ended up buying 15 acres from his parents and built a small log home as a dwelling.50 As Lucy stated, by November 1822 the frame was raised on their comfortable frame house (on the Manchester side of the line) and the Smiths must have moved into it prior to April 1823, for they do not appear on the Palmyra road tax records again.

Some critics have postulated that another log cabin was built on the Manchester 100 acres before the frame house, but no evidence—archaeologically or otherwise—exists to support this theory.51 This is hardly the case, as the tax assessments prove otherwise.

The assessed valuations of the farm itself strongly suggests that as of July 1821, and June 29, 1822, no cabin or frame house was on the Manchester property, for it was valued at $700 each year. But by July 24, 1823, the value had jumped to $1000. The Smiths began in the spring of 1820 to make preparations for building the frame house on the East side of the road (Stafford St.).

The frame was raised in November 1822 and the material necessary to finish the job was obtained according to Joseph’s mother.52 This would necessarily increase the value of the property. On July 24, 1823, the assessment value jumped to $1000, an increase of over forty
percent, indicating the first time a building was now placed on the property. This is evidence that clearly proves the Smiths went from their Palmyra log house to the frame house built on their farm in Manchester after November 1822. No other dwelling existed on the property previously, or the assessment would have shown that.

The Smiths are in the Palmyra road tax district in April 1822, but the frame house was raised by November 1822, allowing for the Smith family to live across the border in Manchester. No other house was built between the small log house and the frame house, or the land assessment would have changed. Before Alvin died on November 19, 1823, he told Hyrum to finish the frame house.53 They had been living in it without it being fully completed. It was still not completed according to Lucy in the fall of 1825 when Josiah Stoal came from Chenango County.54 Joseph’s own 1838 account points to a move to Manchester in 1818 or 1819, and he considered the small log house in Manchester.

**The 1820 Religious Excitement In Palmyra**

Joseph states that about 1820 religious excitement had commenced, and the whole district of country was affected by it. The Palmyra newspaper reported many conversions in the “burned-over” district. Joseph often attended these so-called “revivals” and “camp meetings” in the Palmyra area. The *Palmyra Register* recorded that the Methodists had a religious camp meeting in 1820.55 Since they did not have a chapel yet, they would meet in the woods on Vienna Road.56 Pomeroy Tucker states that “protracted revival meetings were customary in some of the churches, and Smith frequented those of different denominations...”57 These revivals in 1820 must have helped the Methodists, for they were able to build their first church in Palmyra by 1822, down on Vienna Road where they held their camp meetings.58 The Zion Episcopal Church was originated in 1823.59 In 1817, the Presbyterians were able to split into an eastern group and a western group. The eastern group used the only actual church building that was in Palmyra in 1820, while the western group assembled in the town hall.60

Some critics have erroneously supposed that there was no religious excitement in Palmyra in the years 1820 through 1823. This theory has proved false with the finding of the *Palmyra Sentinel* newspaper articles reporting of the Methodist camp meeting in Palmyra in 1820. Also, Pomeroy Tucker and Orsamus Turner were eyewitnesses to the excitement.

**Conclusions**

Historically, Joseph Smith’s telling of the First Vision can fit within the data and evidence available. Joseph Smith was living in the area at the right time to be near the Sacred Grove where God and His Son appeared to him. Eyewitnesses, critical of Joseph Smith, do verify that the Smith’s were there, where Joseph said they were. Critics now try to claim that he was not there. The evidence proves these new critics wrong.

**Further Reading**


**Notes**

1. See Joseph Smith History 1:1.
2. See Joseph Smith History 1:5.
3. See Joseph Smith History 1:3.
4. Ibid.
6. See Joseph Smith History 1:3.
9. See Joseph Smith History 1:5.
10. See Joseph Smith History 1:17.
The Quarterly Journal of Watchman Fellowship (January–March 1988), 4; Jerald and Sandra Tanner, Mormonism—Shadow or Reality?, fifth edition (Salt Lake City: Utah Light-house Ministry, 1987), 143–162-D.


19. A Record of Strangers, 53.


22. Lucy Mack Smith, Biographical Sketches of Joseph Smith the Prophet, and His Progenitors for Many Generations (Liverpool, S.W. Richards, 1853), 66.

23. Ibid.

24. Ibid., 67.


27. Road Tax Records.

28. Ibid.

29. Ibid.; Tucker, Origin, Rise and Progress of Mormonism, 12.


32. Smith, Biographical Sketches, 70–71.

33. Tucker, Origin, Rise and Progress of Mormonism, 12.


35. George W. Cowles, Landmarks of Wayne County (Syracuse, New York: D. Mason & Company, 1895), 182.

36. E.D. Howe, Mormonism Unvailed (Painseville, Ohio: Self Published, 1834), 250, 251, 258.

37. Smith, Biographical Sketches, 43, 57.

38. Smith, Biographical Sketches, 70.

39. Lucy Mack Smith in her preliminary manuscript known as the Martha Coray Manuscript, 43–46.


41. Smith, Biographical Sketches, 87.

42. Rand Hugh Packer, “History of Four Mormon Landmarks In Western New York: The Joseph Smith Farm,....,” A Thesis Presented to the Department of Church History and Doctrine (Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University, August 1975), 43.

43. Smith, A History of Joseph Smith By His Mother, 86–87; Packer, thesis, 43.


45. See Joseph Smith History 1:4.

46. Tucker, Origin, Rise and Progress of Mormonism, 11.

47. Cowles, Landmarks of Wayne County, 182.


49. Turner, History of the Pioneer Settlement; Tucker, Origin, Rise and Progress of Mormonism; Cook, “Palmyra and Vicinity;” and Cowles, Landmarks of Wayne County.

50. Smith, Martha Coray Manuscript, 99.

51. Walters, Joseph Smith’s Move, 17.

52. Smith, A History of Joseph Smith By His Mother, 66, 86, 87.

53. Smith, Biographical Sketches, 88–89.

54. Ibid., 91.

55. Palmyra Register (July 28, 1820).


58. Cowles, Landmarks of Wayne County, 194.

59. Ibid.

60. Ibid., 191–192.

About the Author

Craig Ray is an amateur apologist and Church history fanatic. He served a full-time mission for the Church in England, and has since served in various positions including Gospel Doctrine teacher, missionary preparation instructor, and stake missionary. He currently resides in Mesa, Arizona, where he operates the Latter-Day Research Center, which investigates the claims of LDS critics and their literature. Craig can be contacted at craig_ray@hotmail.com.

Copyright © 2002 by FAIR
**ABOUT FAIR**

The Foundation for Apologetic Information & Research (FAIR) is a non-profit organization dedicated to providing well-documented answers to criticisms of LDS doctrine, belief and practice. Seeking to assist the lay member and scholar alike to respond to intentional and well-meaning attacks on individual faith, FAIR helps publish articles and books that defend the LDS church, operates a Web site that receives thousands of visitors each day, and sponsors research projects and conferences that provide the LDS scholarly community an outlet for getting information into the hands of the average member. With a 501-C3 tax exempt status from the IRS, FAIR is funded by the generosity of its members and contributors, now grown to more than 1,000.

To learn more about FAIR, visit our Web site:

http://www.fairlds.org

You can also write to us at:

FAIR  
PO Box 491677  
Redding, CA  96001